Outline

- Introduction
- Problem setup
- Exact solutions
- Technical dive
- Empirical results
- Take home message
- Discussion

Reyhane

Arian

Mohammad

Paper: Advani, Madhu S., and Andrew M. Saxe. "**High-dimensional** dynamics of generalization error in neural networks." arXiv preprint arXiv:1710.03667 (2017).



Introduction



• How does training error E_t evolve?



Introduction



- How does training error E_t evolve?
- How does generalization error E_g evolve?



Introduction



- How does training error E_t evolve?
- How does generalization error E_g evolve?
- What is the lowest generalization error we can ever get?



Introduction



- How does training error E_t evolve?
- How does generalization error E_g evolve?
- What is the lowest generalization error we can ever get?
- When is the optimal early stopping time?
- How does the number of parameters affect generalization?



Problem setup



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t) / \partial t$
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Problem setup

- Learning from a noisy linear teacher
- A dataset D:

$$\mathcal{D} = \{x^{\mu}, y^{\mu}\}, \mu = 1, \cdots, P$$

• Data generation process (Teacher):

 $y = \bar{w}X + \epsilon.$

 \boldsymbol{X} is input data sampled from a gaussian distribution



Teacher

- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Problem setup

- Learning from a noisy linear teacher
- A dataset D:

$$\mathcal{D} = \{x^{\mu}, y^{\mu}\}, \mu = 1, \cdots, P$$

• Data generation process (Teacher):

 $y = \bar{w}X + \epsilon.$

X is input data sampled from a gaussian distribution

• $ar{w}$ and ϵ are drawn from normal distributions.

$$\begin{array}{ccc} & & \\ & & \\ \sigma_w^2 & \sigma_\epsilon^2 & \longrightarrow & \text{SNR} \equiv \sigma_w^2 / \sigma_\epsilon^2 \end{array}$$

• Dimensions are

$$y \in \mathbb{R}^{1 \times P} \quad \bar{w} \in \mathbb{R}^{1 \times N} \quad x \in \mathbb{R}^{N \times P} \quad \epsilon \in \mathbb{R}^{1 \times P}$$



Teacher

- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

 $P \longrightarrow \# \text{ of examples}$ $N \longrightarrow \# \text{ of dimensions}$

Problem setup

- Data generation process (Teacher):
 - $y = \bar{w}X + \epsilon.$
- Model (Student):
 - $\hat{y} = wX$
- Training Error:

$$E_t(w(t)) = \frac{1}{P} \sum_{\mu=1}^{P} \|y^{\mu} - \hat{y}^{\mu}\|_2^2,$$

• Generalization error:

$$E_g(w(t)) = \left\langle (y - \hat{y})^2 \right\rangle_{x,\epsilon}$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

 $\langle \cdot \rangle$ denotes Expectation

Problem setup

• Training Error:

$$E_t(w(t)) = \frac{1}{P} \sum_{\mu=1}^{P} \|y^{\mu} - \hat{y}^{\mu}\|_2^2,$$

• Gradient descent update rule:

$$w \leftarrow w - \eta \frac{\partial E_t}{\partial w}$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\cdot \ \partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Problem setup

• Training Error:

$$E_t(w(t)) = \frac{1}{P} \sum_{\mu=1}^{P} \|y^{\mu} - \hat{y}^{\mu}\|_2^2,$$

• Gradient descent update rule:

$$w \leftarrow w - \eta \frac{\partial E_t}{\partial w}$$

• It follows that:

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$



- Teacher
- Student
- · $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t):

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$

• Final solution

$$w(t \to \infty) = yX^T(XX^T)^+$$

• How do we get to $w(t \to \infty)$ from w(t = 0)?





- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t):

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$

• Final solution

 $w(t \to \infty) = yX^T(XX^T)^+$

- How do we get to $w(t \to \infty)$ from w(t = 0)?
 - Some change of variables are needed!
 - Input covariance matrix:

 $\Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

 $\dots \bullet \Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t):

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$

• Final solution

$$w(t \to \infty) = yX^T(XX^T)^+$$

- How do we get to $w(t \to \infty)$ from w(t = 0)?
 - Some change of variables are needed!
 - Input covariance matrix:

 $\Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$

 $\Sigma^{yx} = yX^T = \tilde{s}V^T$

• Input-output covariance matrix:



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

 $\Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$

 $\Sigma^{yx} = yX^T = \tilde{s}V^T$

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t):

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$

• Change of variable z = wV

$$\tau \dot{z}(t) = \tilde{s} - z\Lambda$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

$$\Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$$

$$\Sigma^{yx} = yX^T = \tilde{s}V^T$$

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t):

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$

• Change of variable z = wV

$$\tau \dot{z}(t) = \tilde{s} - z\Lambda$$

$$\tilde{s}V^T = yX^T = \bar{w}XX^T + \epsilon X^T = \bar{z}\Lambda V^T + \tilde{\epsilon}\Lambda^{1/2}V^T$$

$$\rightarrow \tilde{s} = \bar{z}\Lambda + \tilde{\epsilon}\Lambda^{1/2}$$

$$\begin{split} y &= \bar{w}X + \epsilon \\ yX^T &= \bar{w}XX^T + \epsilon X^T \\ XX^T &= V\Lambda V^T \Rightarrow X = V\Lambda^{1/2}U^T \\ yX^T &= \bar{w}V\Lambda V^T + \epsilon U\Lambda^{1/2}V^T \\ yX^T &= \bar{w}V\Lambda V^T + \tilde{\epsilon}\Lambda^{1/2}V^T \\ \tilde{s} &= \bar{z}\Lambda + \tilde{\epsilon}\Lambda^{1/2} \end{split}$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices

Finding rotations

- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

 $\Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$

$$\Sigma^{yx} = yX^T = \tilde{s}V^T$$

Exact solutions

Dynamics of w(t):

$$\tau \dot{w}(t) = yX^T - wXX^T$$

Change of variable z = wV

$$\tau \dot{z}(t) = \tilde{s} - z\Lambda$$

$$\tilde{s}V^T = yX^T = \bar{w}XX^T + \epsilon X^T = \bar{z}\Lambda V^T + \tilde{\epsilon}\Lambda^{1/2}V^T$$

$$\rightarrow \tilde{s} = \bar{z}\Lambda + \tilde{\epsilon}\Lambda^{1/2}$$

The learning speed of each mode is independent of the others:

$$\tau \dot{z}_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i)\lambda_i + \tilde{\epsilon}_i \sqrt{\lambda_i}, \qquad i = 1, \cdots, N.$$



- Teacher •
- Student •
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- - Eliminating rotation matrices

Finding rotations

- Solving the equation
- Analyze results

 - t = 0• $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

 $\Sigma^{xx} = XX^T = V\Lambda V^T$

$$\Sigma^{yx} = yX^T = \tilde{s}V^T$$

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t) z(t):

$$\tau \dot{z}_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i)\lambda_i + \tilde{\epsilon}_i \sqrt{\lambda_i}$$

• Solving the differential equation:

$$\bar{z}_i - z_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i(0))e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}} - \frac{\tilde{\epsilon}_i}{\sqrt{\lambda_i}}(1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t) / \partial t$
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t) z(t):

$$\tau \dot{z}_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i)\lambda_i + \tilde{\epsilon}_i \sqrt{\lambda_i}$$

• Solving the differential equation:

$$\bar{z}_i - z_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i(0))e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}} - \frac{\tilde{\epsilon}_i}{\sqrt{\lambda_i}}(1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})$$

• Back to generalization dynamics:

$$E_g(w(t)) = \left\langle (y - \hat{y})^2 \right\rangle_{x,\epsilon}$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Exact solutions

• Dynamics of w(t) z(t):

$$\tau \dot{z}_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i)\lambda_i + \tilde{\epsilon}_i \sqrt{\lambda_i}$$

• Solving the differential equation:

$$\bar{z}_i - z_i = (\bar{z}_i - z_i(0))e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}} - \frac{\tilde{\epsilon}_i}{\sqrt{\lambda_i}}(1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})$$

• Back to generalization dynamics:

$$\begin{split} E_g(w(t)) &= \left\langle (y - \hat{y})^2 \right\rangle_{x,\epsilon} \\ E_g(t) &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_i \left\langle (\bar{z}_i - z_i)^2 \right\rangle + \sigma_\epsilon^2 \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_i \left[(\sigma_w^2 + (\sigma_w^0)^2) e^{-\frac{2\lambda_i t}{\tau}} + \frac{\sigma_\epsilon^2}{\lambda_i} (1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})^2 \right] + \sigma_\epsilon^2 \end{split}$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Technical Dive

$$E_g(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i} \left[(\sigma_w^2 + (\sigma_w^0)^2) e^{-\frac{2\lambda_i t}{\tau}} + \frac{\sigma_\epsilon^2}{\lambda_i} (1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})^2 \right] + \sigma_\epsilon^2$$

initialization effect noise effect lower bound

How it changes over time? How it changes over lambdas? When overfitting happens? Frozen subspace?



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t) / \partial t$
 - Initial solution \longrightarrow final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Technical Dive





- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t) / \partial t$
 - Initial solution \longrightarrow final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results

 - t = 0• $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Generalization Dynamics Technical Dive

• The eigenvalue distribution of *XX^T* approaches the Marchenko-Pasteur distribution

$$\rho^{\mathrm{MP}}(\lambda) = \frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{\sqrt{(\lambda_{+} - \lambda)(\lambda - \lambda_{-})}}{\lambda} + 1_{\alpha < 1}(1 - \alpha)\delta(\lambda)$$

Distribution variable $\longrightarrow \lambda$ Distribution parameters. $\rightarrow \lambda_+, \lambda_-, \alpha$

 $\lambda_{\pm} = (\sqrt{\alpha} \pm 1)^2$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Generalization Dynamics Technical Dive

• The eigenvalue distribution of *XX^T* approaches the Marchenko-Pastur distribution

$$\rho^{\mathrm{MP}}(\lambda) = \frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{\sqrt{(\lambda_{+} - \lambda)(\lambda - \lambda_{-})}}{\lambda} + 1_{\alpha < 1}(1 - \alpha)\delta(\lambda)$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Generalization Dynamics Technical Dive

• The eigenvalue distribution of *XX^T* approaches the Marchenko-Pastur distribution

$$\rho^{\mathrm{MP}}(\lambda) = \frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{\sqrt{(\lambda_{+} - \lambda)(\lambda - \lambda_{-})}}{\lambda} + 1_{\alpha < 1}(1 - \alpha)\delta(\lambda)$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations

 α (# samples/# parameters)

- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time



Technical Dive

• The eigenvalue distribution of XX^T approaches the Marchenko-Pastur distribution





- Teacher •
- Student •
- $\partial w(t) / \partial t$ •
- Initial solution \longrightarrow final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- **Analyze results**
 - t = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- **Optimal time**

Technical Dive

$$E_g(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i \left[(\sigma_w^2 + (\sigma_w^0)^2) e^{-\frac{2\lambda_i t}{\tau}} + \frac{\sigma_\epsilon^2}{\lambda_i} (1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})^2 \right] + \sigma_\epsilon^2$$

• Bringing the distribution in

$$\frac{E_g(t)}{\sigma_w^2} = \int \rho^{\rm MP}(\lambda) \left[e^{-\frac{2\lambda t}{\tau}} + \frac{1}{\lambda \cdot \rm SNR} (1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda t}{\tau}})^2 \right] d\lambda + \frac{1}{\rm SNR}$$



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution → final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time

Technical Dive

$$E_g(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i \left[(\sigma_w^2 + (\sigma_w^0)^2) e^{-\frac{2\lambda_i t}{\tau}} + \frac{\sigma_\epsilon^2}{\lambda_i} (1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda_i t}{\tau}})^2 \right] + \sigma_\epsilon^2$$

Bringing the distribution in

$$\frac{E_g(t)}{\sigma_w^2} = \int \rho^{\rm MP}(\lambda) \left[e^{-\frac{2\lambda t}{\tau}} + \frac{1}{\lambda \cdot \rm SNR} (1 - e^{-\frac{\lambda t}{\tau}})^2 \right] d\lambda + \frac{1}{\rm SNR}$$

• Optimal stopping time

$$t^{opt} = \frac{\tau}{\lambda} \log(\text{SNR} \cdot \lambda + 1).$$

Ó Optimal stopping time differs for different λ 's Causes sub-optimality at early stopping



- Teacher
- Student
- $\partial w(t)$ / ∂t
- Initial solution —— final solution
 - Eliminating rotation matrices
 - Finding rotations
- Solving the equation
- Analyze results
 - *t* = 0
 - $t \to \infty$
- Optimal time



$$\begin{split} w \leftarrow w - \eta \frac{\partial L}{\partial w} \\ \tau \dot{w} &= -\frac{\partial L}{\partial w} \end{split}$$



$$\begin{split} w &\leftarrow w - \eta \frac{\partial L}{\partial w} \\ \tau \dot{w} &= -\frac{\partial L}{\partial w} \end{split}$$

Taylor expansion:

$$f(x) = \bar{f}(a) + f'(a)(x - a)$$

$$f(w) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$$

















Our three cents With help of Remi Tachet



 $u = w - w^*$ $\frac{u'}{u} = -H(w^*) \longrightarrow \ln(u) = -H(w^*)t + C$



$$w \leftarrow w - \eta \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$$

$$\tau \dot{w} = -\frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$$
Taylor expansion:

$$f(x) = f(a) + f'(a)(x - a)$$

$$f(w) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$$

$$f(w) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}\Big|_{w=w^*} + \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial w^2}\Big|_{w=w^*} (w - w^*)$$

$$f(w) = H(w^*)(w - w^*)$$

$$\dot{w} = -H(w^*)(w - w^*)$$

$$u = w - w^*$$

$$\frac{u'}{u} = -H(w^*) \longrightarrow ln(u) = -H(w^*)t + C \longrightarrow w - w^* = w(0)e^{-H(w^*)t}$$

Our three cents With help of Remi Tachet



 $w \leftarrow w - \eta \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$ $\tau \dot{w} = -\frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$ $\int f(x) = f(a) + f'(a)(x - a)$ $f(w) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$ Taylor expansion: $f(w) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}$ $f(w) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial w}\Big|_{w=w^*} + \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial w^2}\Big|_{w=w^*}(w-w^*)$ $f(w) = H(w^*)(w - w^*)$ $\dot{w} = -H(w^*)(w-w^*)$ $\alpha_i = \alpha_i(0)e^{-\lambda_i t}$ $u = w - w^*$ $\frac{u'}{w} = -H(w^*) \longrightarrow \ln(u) = -H(w^*)t + C \longrightarrow w - w^* = w(0)e^{-H(w^*)t}$

Generalization Dynamics Related Work



- Computing Nonvacuous Generalization Bounds for Deep (Stochastic) Neural Networks with Many More Parameters than Training Data (Gintare Karolina Dziugaite & Daniel M. Roy)
 - Concern: overfitting since #model parameters >> # available data points
 - However SGD returns solutions with low test errors on deep models.
 - Nonvacuous generalization bounds for:
 - deep stochastic neural network classifiers
 - with millions of parameters trained on only tens of thousands of examples
 - Extension of Langrod's PAC Bayes
- Why and When Can Deep but Not Shallow Networks Avoid the Curse of Dimensionality: a Review (Poggio et al)
 - Mostly focuses on power of architectures (what it can approximate and learn)
 - Studies the learning process: the unreasonable efficiency of SGD
 - Talks about generalization: over-parametrization is ok and over fitting is not that big of a problem in deep networks rather than in classical shallow networks



Merci :)